

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 TEL AV 04194 01 OF 02 110530Z
ACTION NEA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-04 H-01
INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05 PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02
SS-15 USIA-06 IO-13 ACDA-07 SSM-03 OMB-01 TRSE-00
DHA-02 ORM-02 AID-05 /101 W
-----110538Z 033468 /15

P 101549Z JUN 77
FM AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV
TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 6639
INFO AMEMBASSY AMMAN
AMEMBASSY BUCHAREST
AMEMBASSY CAIRO
AMEMBASSY DAMASCUS
AMEMBASSY JIDDA
AMEMBASSY LONDON
AMCONSUL JERUSALEM
USMISSION SINAI

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 1 OF 2 TEL AVIV 4194

E.O. 11652: GDS
TAGS: PBOR, PGOV, IS, XF
SUBJECT: MOSHE DAYAN'S REMARKS AT JERUSALEM SEMINAR

REF: JERUSALEM 0846

BEGIN SUMMARY: IN EXTEMPORANEOUS REMARKS ON THE
LESSONS TO BE DRAWN FROM THE TEN-YEAR PERIOD AFTER
THE 1967 WAR (DELIVERED AT THE CLOSING SESSION OF A
THREE-DAY SEMINARY SPONSORED BY THE HEBREW UNIVERSITY
OF JERUSALEM), MOSHE DAYAN SAID THAT (1) DIRECT
ISRAELI-ABR NEGOTIATIONS WILL NOT NECESSARILY LEAD
TO SUCCESS; (2) THERE IS NO ACCEPTABLE LINE WHICH
COULD BE DRAWN FOR "TERRITORIAL COMPROMISE" BETWEEN
ISRAEL AND THE ARABS;AND (3) A SECOND BEST SOLUTION
WOULD BE TO SOLVE THE REFUGEE PROBLEM. DAYAN
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 TEL AV 04194 01 OF 02 110530Z

IMPLICITLY REJECTED THE PALESTINIAN REFUGEES'
"RIGHT TO RETURN" AND THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A
WEST BANK/GAZA STRIP STATE. HE DID NOT MENTION
INTERIM AGREEMENTS, COMPREHENSIVE SOLUTIONS, OR
THE ROLE OF OUTSIDE POWERS IN ASSISTING NEGOTIA-
TIONS.HE REJECTED "FEDERATION" AND
"CONFEDERATION" AS POSSIBLE SOLUTIONS OF ISRAELI-

JORDANIAN DIFFERENCES OVER THE WEST BANK. END SUMMARY

1. ATMOSPHERE: DAYAN SPOKE FROM NOTES HE DREW UP ON THE DAIS IN FULL VIEW OF AN OVERFLOW AUDIENCE (WHICH SPILLED OVER INTO THE CORRIDORS AND UP ONTO A SECOND-FLOOR PASSAGEWAY WHERE AUXILIARY SPEAKERS WERE HASITLY SET UP FOR SEVERAL HUNDERED EXCESS SPRAWLING LISTENERS); AS DAYAN MADE HIS NOTES, HE WAS SEEMINGLY OBLIVIOUS TO ANWAR NUSSEIBEH'S ELOQUENT DELIVERY OF A CAREFULLY-CRAFTED AND WELL-REASONED EXPOSITION. (DAYAN LATER TOLD AMBASSADOR THAT HE HAD BEEN TOLD NO PREPARED SPEECHES WERE TO BE MADE; RATHER THAT THE MEETING WAS TO BE AN EXTEMPTORANEOUS PANEL DISCUSSION.) DAYAN'S REMARKS WERE WELL RECEIVED BY A SYMPATHETIC AUDIENCE, ESPCIALLY AT THE OUTSET, WHEN HE DREW SEVERAL ROUNDS OF APPLAUSE BY INDIRECTLY DISCOUNTING NUSSEIBEH'S ARGUMENT BY REMARKS SUCH AS "WE WOULD NOT HAVE HAD ALL THESE WARS IF THE ARABS HAD ACCEPTED IN 1948 TO LIVE WITH US IN PEACE."

2. DAYAN DREW HIS FIRST "LESSON" FROM THE 1967-77 PERIOD BY REJECTING AN ARGUMENT (ESPOUSED BY BEGIN ON THE DAY AFTER HIS ELECTIN VICTORY) THAT ISRAEL AND THE ARABS MUST HAVE DIRECT NEGOTIATIONS. DAYAN SAID THAT DIRECT NEGOTIATIONS WILL NOT NECESSARILY LEAD TO ANY SOLUTION, AND THAT POINT COULD BE SHOWN BY THE FACT THAT

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 TEL AV 04194 01 OF 02 110530Z

ISRAEL AND JORDAN HAD ENGAGED IN DIRECT NEGOTIATIONS FOR TEN YEARS WITHOUT ANY RESULT. (DAYAN DID NOT REFER TO THE ROLE OF OUTSIDE POWERS IN ASSISTING IN NEGOTIATIONS, BUT HE HAS PREVIOUSLY INSISTED THAT IT IS COUNTERPRODUCTIVE FOR THE U.S. TO EXCLUDE THE SOVIET UNION FROM MEANINGFUL PARTICIPATION.)

3. DAYAN'S SECOND LESSON WAS THAT THERE IS NO LINE WHICH COULD BE DRAWN ON THE WEST BANK THAT WOULD BE ACCEPTABLE TO "BOTH PARTIES" (I.E., ISRAEL AND JORDAN, BY IMPLICATION, NOT THE PLO), "NOT THE ALLONPLAN, OR THE DASH PLAN (DMC'S POSITION IS NOT A PLAN, BUT THIS REMARK WAS AN OBVIOUS REFERENCE TO THE FOREIGN POLICY DIFFERENCES SEPARATING DMC AND LIKUD) OR WHATEVER PLAN." HE WENT ON: "MY PERSONAL EXPERIENCE IS THAT THERE ISN'T SUCH A LINE. THIS LEAVES US WITH THE QUESTION WHETHER THERE SILL BE AN AGREEMENT.

PERSONALLY, I DOUBT IT. THE NEXT QUESTION IS,
HOW DO WE LIVE TOGETHER IF THERE IS NO SOLUTION,
AND THAT IS THE QUESTION, NOT HOW TO GET TO
GENEVA. IT SHOULD BE CLEAR TO ALL OF US THAT
WITHOUT AN ANSWER TO THIS QUESTION, WE WILL HAVE
TO ACCEPT DICTATES. I THINK THERE IS A WAY..."

4. DAYAN DID NOT GO ON TO SPELL OUT EXPLICITLY WHAT
HE THOUGHT THAT WAY MIGHT BE, BUT INSTEAD
DIGRESSED TO TALK ABOUT THE PROBLEM OF THE
(PALESTINIAN) REFUGEES. "THERE ARE ABOUT
A MILLION REFUGEES: 500,000 IN JORDAN, 300,000
IN LEBANON, AND 200,000 IN THE GAZA STRIP. MANY
OF THESE PEOPLE WANT TO RETURN TO THEIR HOMES,
AND WE HAVE TO POINT OUT THAT IF THE REFUGEES
WANT TO GO BACK HOME, ISRAELI WITHDRAWAL FROM THE
GAZA STRIP DOESN'T HELP. THE LESSON OF THE
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 04 TEL AV 04194 01 OF 02 110530Z

ESTABLISHING OF THE STATE OF ISRAEL IS THAT IT
HAS BEEN AT THE SAKE OF SOME OF PALESTINE. THAT'S
A SAD FACT, BUT WE HAVE TO ACCEPT IT....YASSIR
ARAFAT WAS QUITE HONEST WHEN HE WENT TO THE UN,
HE NEVER SUGGESTED THERE THAT PART OF PALESTINE
WOULD SERVE. NO, IF THEY GO BACK, THERE
WON'T BE AN ISRAEL. THEY DIDN'T COME FROM NABLUS,

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 TEL AV 04194 02 OF 02 110537Z
ACTION NEA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-04 H-01
INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05 PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02
SS-15 USIA-06 IO-13 ACDA-07 SSM-03 OMB-01 TRSE-00
DHA-02 ORM-02 AID-05 /101 W
-----110544Z 033515 /15

P 101549Z JUN 77

FM AMEMBASSY TEL AVIV
TO SECSTATE WASHDC PRIORITY 6640
INFO AMEMBASSY AMMAN

AMEMBASSY BUCHAREST
AMEMBASSY CAIRO
AMEMBASSY DAMASCUS
AMEMBASSY JIDDA
AMEMBASSY LONDON
AMCONSUL JERUSALEM
USMISSION SINAI

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 2 OF 2 TEL AVIV 4194

AND THEY DON'T WANT TO GO BACK TO NABLUS.."
THUS, IN TALKING ABOUT THE REFUGEES, DAYAN HAS
ADDRESSED WHAT IS ONE OF THE KEY ISSUES TO THE
PALESTINIANS, VIZ., THE "RIGHT OF RETURN," AND
HE HAS SHOWN THAT IT IS INIMICAL TO ISRAELS
NATIONAL INTEREST. DAYAN HAS ALSO IMPLICITLY
REJECTED THE IDEA OF A WEST BANK/GAZA STRIP
"MINI-STATE," BECAUSE IT IS NOT SOMETHING THAT
THE PALESTINIANS WOULD BE SATISFIED WITH.

5. CONTINUING WITH THE REFUGEE THEME, DAYAN
ASKED, WHAT IS A REGUGEE? IT IS SOMEONE WITH
NO CITIZENSHIP, NO PAPERS, NO WORK, NO
ACCOMMODATIONS. HE SUGGESTED (AS HE DID TO SENATOR
STONE) THAT "INTERNATIONAL BODIES" SHOULD HELP
JORDAN TO SETTLE ITS HALF-MILLION REFUGEES, AND
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 TEL AV 04194 02 OF 02 110537Z

ISRAEL WOULD ATTEMPT TO SETTLE THOSE IN THE GAZA
STRIP, "WHO WOULD RATHER, IF THEY CANNOT GO
BACK TO THEIR HOMES, REMAIN IN THE GAZA STRIP
THAN GO TO THE WEST BANK OR TO ANY OTHER ARAB
COUNTRY," "I DON'T KNOW WHAT TO DO ABOUT THE
REFUGEES IN LEBANON, BUT THE ONE THING SURE IS
THAT THEY DON'T WANT TO GO AND LIVE IN NABLUS,
NEIGHER GEORGE HABASH NOR YASSIR ARAFAT WANT
TO LIVE IN NABLUS."

6. THIS THEN IS DAYAN'S "SECOND-BEST" SOLUTION,
TO "SOLVE THE REFUGEE PROBLEM." DAYAN THEN RETURNED
TO HIS MAIN LINE OF REASONING BY ASKING: "WHY IS THERE
NO LINE ACCEPTABLE TO THE TWO PARTIES;:"
HE ANSWERED HIS QUESTION WITH ANOTHER: "WHERE
IS THE LINE IN JERUSALEM BY WHICH YOU WANT TO DIVIDE
IT?" AND "I'M SURE THAT THE PEOPLE OF BETHELEM DON'T
WANT TO BE CUT OFF FROM JERUSALEM. WHAT LINE
WOULD YOU DRAW BETWEEN BETHLEHEM AND JERUSALEM?
LADIES AND GENTLEMEN, THE LINES OF 1948 ARE
NOTHING MORE THAN THE RESULTS OF WAR, JUST THAT.
THEY ARE NOT HOLY, NO MORE THAN THE PRESENT LINES

ARE HOLY. (AN IMPLICIT REFERENCE TO TERRITORIAL COMPROMISE?) THE 1949 LINES WERE NEVER AGREED UPON, AND WHAT WAS ACCEPTED BY THE OTHER SIDE WAS NEVER HONORED."

7. IN THE QUESTION-AND-ANSWER PERIOD WHICH FOLLOWED THE SPEAKER'S REMARKS, THEY WERE ASKED TO COMMENT ON PERES' OBSERVATIONS AT THE OPENING OF THE SEMINAR, TO THE EFFECT THAT TWO LESSONS OF THE LAST TEN YEARS WERE: (1) THE ARAB DEMONIC FEAR OF JEWS HAS BEEN DISSIPATED SOMEWHAT, WHICH IS A HOPEFUL TURN; AND (2) THERE OUGHT TO BE A "FEDERAL" OF "CONFEDERAL" SOLUTION OF THE WEST BANK PROBLEM. DAYAN DISAGREED WITH BOTH VIEWS. CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 TEL AV 04194 02 OF 02 110537Z

IN RESPONSE TO THE FIRST, HE SAID THAT THERE WERE WARS IN 1948 AND 1967, NOT BECAUSE THE ARABS THOUGHT THE JEWS WERE BAD PEOPLE, BUT BECAUSE THEY DID NOT WANT A JEWISH STATE. (HE DID NOT REFER TO ANY POSSIBLY CHANGED ATTITUDE AMONG SOME ARABS.) AS TO THE SECOND POINT, HE SAID THAT HE DOES NOT BELIEVE THAT THE ARABS IN THE WEST BANK WOULD WANT A PARTNERSHIP WITH ISRAELIS RATHER THAN WITH THEIR ARAB BRETHREN. THAT WOULD BE HIS REACTION TOO IF HE WERE AN ARAB.

8. AT A DINNER PARTY THE FOLLOWING EVENING, DAYAN TALKED AT SOME LENGTH WITH THE AMBASSADOR ABOUT THE "DEBATE," RESTATING IN SOMEWHAT LESS CATEGORICAL TERMS MANY OF THESE POINTS. ONE POINT HE MADE FORCEFULLY, HOWEVER. HE DOES BELIEVE IT IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT SOMEHOW TO GET NEGOTIATIONS UNDERWAY AGAIN, PREFERABLY AT GENEVA IF NOT ELSEWHERE. WHILE HE IS PESSIMISTIC ABOUT THEIR PROSPECTS, HE SEES GREAT VALUE IN NEGOTIATIONS THEMSELVES AS A WAY TO AVOID A DRIFT BACK TOWARDS WAR, ESPECIALLY SECRET NEGOTIATIONS, AND DOES NOT EXCLUDE UNFORESEEN OPENINGS FROM LEADING TO AT LEAST NEW AGREEMENTS ON LESS THAN A TOTAL SETTLEMENT. LEWIS

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: SEMINARS, SPEECHES
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 10-Jun-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977TELAV04194
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D770208-1134
Format: TEL
From: TEL AVIV
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770667/aaaacgur.tel
Line Count: 270
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: f368e57e-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ACTION NEA
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 5
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 77 JERUSALEM 846
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 04-Feb-2005 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 2188344
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: MOSHE DAYAN'S REMARKS AT JERUSALEM SEMINAR
TAGS: PBOR, PGOV, IS, XF, (DAYAN, MOSHE)
To: STATE
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odb://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/f368e57e-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009